**Instructions for reviewers**

* Make sure you separate your comments on the case from those on the teaching notes (two distinct sections);
* Begin by highlighting the strengths or positive aspects of the case or teaching notes. What did you like?
* There is no need to summarize the case at the beginning of your report;
* Try to be constructive in your criticism, notably by proposing possible options or solutions to the problems or weaknesses observed;
* Avoid steering the case away from the teaching objectives established by the authors;
* Adopt a respectful and polite tone;
* Be coherent: your detailed comments to the authors should be consistent with your general recommendation to the editor. For example, if you point out one or two weaknesses to the authors, but you recommend rejection of the case to the editor, then you are not being coherent. The same is true if you report major problems in the case or teaching notes in your detailed report, but your recommendation to the editor is “Accept without revision”;
* Make sure that the authors cannot identify you when reading your report.

Please use the review grid below for your review report.

**Review grid for case and teaching notes**

|  |
| --- |
| **Case Review** |
| **Question** | **Your review** |
| Is this case interesting? Please explain. |  |
| Is the case sufficiently complete, complex, and focused to be worthy of publication? Please explain. |  |
| Does the case present a situation, problem, or issue that is worthy of publication? Please explain. |  |
| Are graphs, charts, and tables adequately displayed? |  |
| Other comments or additional suggestions? |  |
| **Teaching Notes Review** |
| **Question** | **Your review** |
| Do the teaching notes include these following elements?* Synopsis
* Source of data
* Description of the fields for which the case is intended
* Level of student
* Learning objectives
* Relevant texts
* Discussion questions and answers
* Teaching strategy
* Theory as appropriate
* Epilogue, if known
 |  |
| Are the teaching objectives of the case clearly set forth? Can the case be used to meet those objectives? |  |
| Are the teaching notes complete? Does it cover all case objectives? Are answers complete and based on information found within the case? Is topic coverage comprehensive? |  |
| Do the teaching notes relate case issues to current theory, practice, or literature in the fields intended for case use? |  |
| **Overall Review** |
| **Question** | **Your review** |
| Is the case well written and suitably organized? |  |
| Are spelling, grammar, and punctuation correct? |  |